



Civil society monitoring report  
on implementation  
of the national Roma integration strategy  
in Denmark

*Assessing the progress  
in four key policy areas  
of the strategy*

**Prepared by:**  
Camilla Ida Ravnbøl  
February 2019



**EUROPEAN COMMISSION**

Directorate-General for Justice and Consumers  
Directorate D — Equality and Union Citizenship  
Unit D1 Non Discrimination and Roma Coordination

*European Commission*  
*B-1049 Brussels*

**Civil society monitoring report  
on implementation of the  
national Roma integration strategy  
in Denmark**

*Assessing the progress in four key policy areas of the strategy*

***EUROPE DIRECT is a service to help you find answers  
to your questions about the European Union***

Freephone number (\*):  
00 800 6 7 8 9 10 11

(\* The information given is free, as are most calls (though some operators, phone boxes or hotels may charge you)

**LEGAL NOTICE**

"The European Commission support for the production of this publication does not constitute endorsement of the contents which reflects the views only of the authors, and the Commission cannot be held responsible for any use which may be made of the information contained therein."

More information on the European Union is available on the Internet (<http://www.europa.eu>).

Luxembourg: Publications Office of the European Union, 2019

Print	ISBN 978-92-76-08346-7	doi:10.2838/691071	Catalogue number DS-02-19-440-EN-C
PDF	ISBN 978-92-76-08347-4	doi:10.2838/742313	Catalogue number DS-02-19-440-EN-N

© European Union, 2019

Reproduction is authorised provided the source is acknowledged.

The report has been prepared by Ms. Camilla Ida Ravnbøl as an independent researcher.

The report has been prepared as part of the Roma Civil Monitor pilot project, 'Capacity-building for Roma civil society and strengthening its involvement in the monitoring of National Roma Integration Strategies'. The pilot project is carried out for the European Commission, DG Justice and Consumers. It is coordinated by the *Center for Policy Studies* of the Central European University (CEU CPS), in partnership with the European Roma Grassroots Organisations Network (ERGO Network), the European Roma Rights Centre (ERRC), the *Fundación Secretariado Gitano* (FSG) and the Roma Education Fund (REF) and implemented with around 90 NGOs and experts from up to 27 member states.

Although the Roma Civil Monitor pilot project, as part of which the report was prepared, is coordinated by CEU, the report represents the findings of the author and it does not necessarily reflect the views of CEU. CEU cannot be held responsible for any use which may be made of the information contained therein.



# CONTENTS

<b>LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS</b> .....	6
<b>EXECUTIVE SUMMARY</b> .....	7
<b>INTRODUCTION</b> .....	9
<b>EMPLOYMENT</b> .....	12
The fight against discrimination in employment and antigypsyism in the workplace .....	13
Employment of EU citizens of Roma origin .....	13
<b>HOUSING AND ESSENTIAL PUBLIC SERVICES</b> .....	16
The fight against discrimination, residential segregation and other forms of antigypsyism in housing .....	17
Housing for EU citizens of Romani origin .....	17
<b>IMPACT OF HEALTH CARE POLICIES ON ROMA</b> .....	20
The fight against discrimination and antigypsyism in health care .....	21
Health concerns of EU citizens of Roma origin .....	21
<b>EDUCATION</b> .....	23
The fight against discrimination, segregation and other forms of antigypsyism in education .....	24
Education for EU citizens of Roma origin .....	25
<b>RECOMMENDATIONS</b> .....	27
<b>BIBLIOGRAPHY</b> .....	29

## LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

DIHR	Danish Institute for Human Rights
DRC	Advisory Centre on Racial Discrimination
ECRI	European Commission against Racism and Intolerance
NRIS	National Roma Integration Strategy

## EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

This report concerns the Danish approach to Roma inclusion within the four thematic areas of employment, housing, education and health in response to the EU Framework for National Roma Integration Strategies up to 2020. Denmark's National Roma Integration Strategy is a set of integrated policy measures that do not include Roma-targeted initiatives, but rather states that Roma are included within general integration initiatives. Consequently, there are no specific initiatives or specific funding opportunities for Roma at governmental or municipal level. Roma inclusion is not mainstreamed as a specific issue across the ministries and there are no Roma-targeted initiatives at governmental or municipal levels. For this reason, there are no specific efforts or initiatives for Roma within the areas of employment, housing, health and education.

Furthermore, since ethnic data is not collected in Denmark, there is no data available on the situation of the national Roma population within the four thematic areas. No studies or reports have previously been made to evaluate the access of the national Roma population to such services and measures. Consequently, neither qualitative nor quantitative data are available concerning the national Roma population. This report therefore highlights the more general context for ethnic minorities in Denmark as an inspiration for areas where more research is needed concerning Roma specifically. The main recommendation that arises from this report is therefore the need for a comprehensive qualitative study evaluating the access of the national Roma population to employment, housing, health and education. This study should be undertaken with the active involvement of researchers of Roma origin at its centre.

The sections concerning EU citizens of Romani origin are based on qualitative data collected by the author of this report in connection with her doctoral and post-doctoral research on a group of Romanian Roma women and men who live in homelessness in Denmark.



## INTRODUCTION

In December 2012, Denmark presented the National Roma Inclusion Strategy (NRIS) in response to the EU Framework for National Roma Integration Strategies adopted by the EC and the European Council in 2011. The Danish NRIS is not a strategy as such, rather, it is an integrated set of policy measures, but since the Danish Government and the EC refer to the document as the NRIS, this report continues to adopt this terminology.<sup>1</sup> The Danish NRIS does not include specific programmes or measures for Roma in Denmark but states that Roma are included in broader national integration policies. Since the adoption of the NRIS, no Roma-targeted initiatives have been developed at governmental or municipal level.

The Roma population in Denmark can largely be discussed in two categories, national Roma and other EU citizens of Roma origin. There are no official statistics on the national Roma population in Denmark since ethnic data is not recorded by Danish authorities and institutions.<sup>2</sup> Estimations of the population size range between 1,500-10,000 national Roma in Denmark.<sup>3</sup> The national Roma population is (again, roughly) comprised of migrant workers from the former Yugoslav republics who arrived in Denmark in the 1970s, as well as former refugees from the Yugoslav Wars and their families who arrived in the 1990s.<sup>4</sup> In regards to other EU citizens of Roma origin, there are no official statistics on the numbers who reside in Denmark.<sup>5</sup> There are currently no active Roma NGOs in Denmark and national organisations and institutions that work with human rights and the social inclusion of minorities do currently not have Roma-specific activities.<sup>6</sup>

Roma who hold national citizenship or permanent residency in Denmark are entitled to rights and state services on an equal footing with the majority population in Denmark. This includes access to public education, public health care, social housing, labour market assistance, etc. For this reason, the situation of the national Roma population in Denmark diverges significantly from the situation of Roma in other EU Member States, including in Romania, Hungary and Bulgaria, where many Roma live on the margins of society with little or no access to housing, quality education and labour market integration. This being said, there remains a need to investigate how this access that the national Roma population has to the four areas of concern unfolds in practice - and not only by way of law (*de jure*). There is a need for comprehensive insight into how Roma in Denmark experience their inclusion into Danish society in their everyday lives including whether and how they experience barriers related to employment, housing, health and education.

---

<sup>1</sup> See information on the Danish NRIS available at: [https://ec.europa.eu/info/policies/justice-and-fundamental-rights/combating-discrimination/roma-and-eu/roma-integration-eu-country/roma-integration-denmark\\_en](https://ec.europa.eu/info/policies/justice-and-fundamental-rights/combating-discrimination/roma-and-eu/roma-integration-eu-country/roma-integration-denmark_en) (accessed 08.01.2017) and Danish government's presentation to the EC of Denmark's NRIS available at: [https://ec.europa.eu/info/sites/info/files/roma\\_denmark\\_strategy\\_en.pdf](https://ec.europa.eu/info/sites/info/files/roma_denmark_strategy_en.pdf) (accessed 03.04.2019).

<sup>2</sup> Danish legislation concerning personal data collection available at: <https://www.retsinformation.dk/forms/r0710.aspx?id=828> (accessed 03.04.2019).

<sup>3</sup> DIHR report 2012:4; Committee on Legal Affairs 2002:Appendix 1; Danish website about Roma developed by Biljana Muncan and Johannes Laursen: [http://romnet.dk/spg.html#\\_antal](http://romnet.dk/spg.html#_antal) (accessed 03.04.2019).

<sup>4</sup> DIHR report 2012:5; Jørgen Anker et al. 2011:4; and Muncan and Laursen at: [http://romnet.dk/spg.html#\\_antal](http://romnet.dk/spg.html#_antal).

<sup>5</sup> Statistics from year 2016 at: <http://ujm.dk/nyheder/integration-i-tal/integration-i-tal-nr-3-september-2016/eu-borgere-i-danmark> (accessed 03.04.2019).

<sup>6</sup> Several minor activities have been carried out over the years including photo exhibitions (see e.g. <https://globalnyt.dk/content/fotoudstilling-be-beautiful-gypsy>). Amnesty International in Denmark had a Roma campaign in 2013 see: <https://amnesty.dk/nyhedsliste/arkiv-2014/europas-ledere-svigter-romaerne>. In 2018, the Danish National TV organized a Roma cultural event on the international Roma day (8 April 2018), see: <https://drkoncerthuset.dk/event/verdensemusikariet-roma-musikfestival/>

Given the short timeframe of this report and its limited scope, such a comprehensive qualitative study concerning the national Roma population could not be undertaken. The unavailability of ethnic data as well as other studies concerning the livelihood conditions of Danish Roma has presented several methodological and analytical limitations for this report. One key limitation has been the validity of including interviews in the data analysis. Building the analysis just on a few interviews without any comparative data for triangulation could potentially lead to a skewed picture of the actual situation for the Roma. Not having other data sources to compare the interviews with would make the few interviews totally representative of the general national Roma population, which would obviously be incorrect. In order for a small number of interviews to be functional in an analytical context, they need to be analysed in relation to other data. For this reason, this report rests on desk research of reports and studies that address the more general situation of the social inclusion of ethnic minorities and vulnerable groups in the areas of employment, housing, education and health. It brings forward a few selected examples but is not intended to be exhaustive in its account of general policies.

The sections concerning EU citizens of Romani origin who reside in Denmark are based on qualitative data concerning a group of Roma women and men who live in homelessness on the streets of Copenhagen. The ethnographic data consists of participant observations as well as informal conversations and semi-structured interviews with women and men who self-identify as Roma and are Romanian citizens.<sup>7</sup> It is important to underline that this data is not representative of all EU citizens of Romani origin who live and work in Denmark. Rather, it is representative of some of the concerns that relate to destitute EU citizens involved in intra-EU migration and the challenges that EU citizens who live in poverty experience when they migrate abroad, in this specific case, to Denmark.

This report is written by the author as an independent researcher in consultation with institutions and experts who work within fields of relevance (consultation period January 2019 – April 2019). Their comments and suggestions are incorporated into the final report.

### ***(Lack of) Access to Data***

The Danish authorities do not record data about ethnic origin (e.g., Roma origin). The authorities have registered data on immigrants and descendants, on foreign nationals and on newly arrived refugees and immigrants.<sup>8</sup> These data include country of origin, citizenship, gender, age, housing status, employment status, and educational attainment, as well as the Danish education and training for employment attained by each individual from these population groups. The Danish authorities also have survey data about equal treatment, self-determination, citizenship and Danish language skills.<sup>9</sup>

The Ministry of Immigration and Integration has developed an on-line monitoring mechanism called the "integration barometer".<sup>10</sup> The barometer is a webpage with statistics, graphs, charts and reports that monitors development with respect to the Government's nine goals concerning integration in employment, education, Danish language skills, citizenship, equal treatment, self-determination, self-sufficiency, and the abatement of deprived urban areas and crime. The integration barometer focuses on immigrants and their descendants and on newly-arrived refugees and family-united

---

<sup>7</sup> See list of bibliography, Ravnbøl 2015, 2017, 2018.

<sup>8</sup> The categories of "immigrants" and "descendants of immigrants" are defined by the Danish national authorities and not by the author of this report.

<sup>9</sup> Periodic report to CERD (C/DNK/22-24) 2019: 3. The combined 22nd to 24th periodic report submitted by the Government of Denmark under article 9 of the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination (CERD).

<sup>10</sup> Accessible at: <https://integrationsbarometer.dk/barometer>

persons to refugees.<sup>11</sup> Furthermore, the Ministry of Immigration and Integration also produces reports and articles on immigrants and their descendants and on newly-arrived refugees. This includes providing analyses of developments in immigrants' countries of origin, of their citizenship, age, gender, housing, employment, education, Danish education, training for employment, equal treatment, self-determination, citizenship, Danish language skills and crim.<sup>12</sup>

The integration barometer builds on statistical categories established by Statistics Denmark, the central authority in charge of Danish statistics. This authority compiles data on Danish society and differentiates between nationality, citizenship, gender, and age. Statistics Denmark has defined particular categories for immigrants and descendants of immigrants, and within these categories they differentiate between persons of "Western origin" and those of "non-Western origin". All EU Member States plus Andorra, Iceland, Liechtenstein, Monaco, Norway, San Marino, Switzerland, The Vatican State, Canada, USA, Australia and New Zealand are considered "Western". All other countries fall within the category of "non-Western" countries.<sup>13</sup>

This distinction is important for the analysis in this report because it presents challenges to the possibilities for assessing the situation of the Danish Roma population. Since the national Roma population largely comes from countries in the Balkan region, some belong to the category of immigrants and their descendants from "Western countries" (e.g., Croatia) whereas others belong to the category of immigrants and their descendants from "non-Western" countries (such as Serbia, Bosnia-Herzegovina, North Macedonia, Kosovo, and Albania). Using the national statistics available on the issues relating to the thematic areas of this report in order to draw conclusions about the Roma hence proves difficult, since their population falls into both the "non-Western" and "Western" categories.

The European Commission against Racism and Intolerance (ECRI) has underlined in several reports that there are challenges pertaining to education and unemployment among Roma in Denmark. In a report from 2017, ECRI reiterated its previous criticism (from 2012 and 2014) of the Danish Government for not measuring how the equal treatment approach impacts the situation of Roma people.<sup>14</sup> The present report reaffirms the need to measure the situation of Roma in Denmark with a specific view to studying qualitatively their experiences in employment, housing, health and education.

The data collection for this report included communication and consultation with a range of stakeholders in Danish ministries and other state institutions, as well a more extensive desk study of the relevant reports, studies and statistics. The qualitative data on EU citizens of Romani origin was collected by the author during 2014-2018.

---

<sup>11</sup> These categories have been defined by the Danish national authorities.

<sup>12</sup> Periodic report to CERD (C/DNK/22-24) 2019: 3.

<sup>13</sup> <https://www.dst.dk/da/Statistik/dokumentation/statistikdokumentation/indvandrerere-og-efterkommere/indhold>

<sup>14</sup> European Commission against Racism and Intolerance report (ECRI) 2017: 27. Available at: <https://www.coe.int/t/dghl/monitoring/ecri/country-by-country/denmark/DNK-CbC-V-2017-020-ENG.pdf>

## EMPLOYMENT

Statistics show that as of 2018, the employment rate among “non-Western” immigrants and their descendants (age 18-64) was 56% for the male population and 46% for the female population, while among persons of Danish origin it was 74% (women) and 75% (men).<sup>15</sup> This indicates a slight drop in unemployment rates compared to previous years, where in 2014, the employment rate for the Danish population was 79%, and for immigrants and their descendants of “non-Western” origin it was 52%.

Whereas there are multiple and often interrelated reasons for the difference in employment rates between persons of Danish origin and immigrants and their descendants, one possible reason could be discrimination and ethnic biases within the Danish labour market.<sup>16</sup> This aspect is reflected in the integration barometer as of 2013, where 25% of immigrants and their descendants in the age group 18-29 report having experienced discrimination in job-searching.<sup>17</sup>

Direct and indirect discrimination are prohibited on the Danish labour market, including during hiring processes, employment, and termination of contracts. The regulations against discrimination are defined in the Act Prohibiting Discrimination in Employment.<sup>18</sup> Complaints of discriminatory treatment can be submitted to the Board of Equal Treatment. Filing a complaint is free of charge and is carried out through the website of the National Board of Appeals.

In a study from 2017, the Danish Institute for Human Rights (hereafter DIHR) evaluates the possibilities that Danish workplaces have for utilizing positive discrimination and other active measures as tools for promoting equal opportunities for ethnic minorities in the Danish labour market.<sup>19</sup> The DIHR defines active measures as including “soft” initiatives such as diversity policies, setting target figures, non-traditional recruitment strategies, and training in diversity management. Initiatives may also include specific positive discrimination measures providing a head start for ethnic minorities, such as employment quotas.<sup>20</sup> The DIHR study shows that the current Danish legal framework is restrictive and there is a lack of transparency and clarity concerning the regulations and their scope. Consequently, Danish employers are in doubt as to which active measures are legal. On the basis of this analysis, the DIHR recommends that the Ministry of Employment update the guidelines on the Danish Act on Prohibition against Discrimination on the Labour Market. This includes clarifying under what circumstances and how workplaces can, voluntarily and pursuant to existing regulations, implement active measures to promote equal opportunities for ethnic minorities in the labour market.<sup>21</sup> Furthermore, the DIHR recommends that public and private employers should be granted the same possibilities for promoting employment opportunities for ethnic minorities as they currently have for promoting the job prospects of older employees and disabled persons.<sup>22</sup>

---

<sup>15</sup> See the Integration Barometer at: <https://integrationsbarometer.dk/tal-og-analyser/beskaeftigelse>

<sup>16</sup> DIHR Report 2017:10

<sup>17</sup> The Ministry of Immigration and Integration report 2015:16

<sup>18</sup> Act Prohibiting Discrimination in Employment no. 1001, 24 August 2017. Available at: <https://www.retsinformation.dk/Forms/R0710.aspx?id=179869> (accessed 03.04.2019).

<sup>19</sup> DIHR report 2017: 8.

<sup>20</sup> DIHR report 2017:10.

<sup>21</sup> DIHR report 2017: 9.

<sup>22</sup> *Op cit.* note 16.

Different employment measures and initiatives exist for including ethnic minorities into the labour market, and several initiatives focus specifically on newly-arriving immigrants and refugees. One example of measures for strengthening the inclusion of immigrants and refugees into the labour market is the use of so-called target figures. The Danish Government established the use of target figures in 2005 in order to ensure that the composition of public employee groups, to the farthest extent possible, reflect the existing labour force in Denmark. The target for non-Western ethnic minorities employed in public institutions was set at 4%.<sup>23</sup> In the period from 2005 to 2014, the number of public employees of “non-Western” origin increased from 2% to 3.6%.<sup>24</sup>

In 2017 the Government introduced a new job and training model called the IGU, which targets newly-arriving immigrants and refugees. The aim of the IGU model is that new arrivals gradually gain skills and competencies to work at the level of regular employment.<sup>25</sup> This is to be acquired in a workplace over the course of two years, combined with periods of schooling. The IGU model rests on the recognition that many new arrivals initially may not possess the skills required to qualify for a job at the regular Danish wage level offering standard working conditions. The IGU programme includes apprentice pay and ensures that working periods are combined with training periods. The integration barometer shows that as of January 2019, there were 1,890 registered IGU initiatives for employment.<sup>26</sup>

The relevance of the IGU model for Denmark’s Roma population cannot be determined due to a lack of ethnic data, but it appears to be minimal. Most of the national Roma arrived in Denmark from the 1960s-1990s, and for this reason they are no longer part of the category of “new arrivals”. Combined with the fact that the national Roma population also includes persons who are defined as having “Western origin” (e.g., coming from countries within the EU) this indicates that Roma are most probably not targets of the IGU model, which is designed for new arrivals from “non-Western” countries.

Due to a lack of ethnic data, it is impossible to determine whether the initiatives for setting target figures for employing ethnic minorities in public institutions have an impact on the national Roma population.

### The fight against discrimination in employment and antigypsyism in the workplace

As far as the research for this study has been able to detect, there are no existing initiatives concerning antigypsyism in Danish workplaces. Furthermore, due to the lack of ethnic data, it is impossible to evaluate whether and how discrimination is a concern amongst Roma women and men in the Danish labour market. There is a need for more comprehensive study of the experiences of the national Roma population with employment.

### Employment of EU citizens of Roma origin

Denmark ensures the right of EU citizens to free movement according to EU Directive 2004/38/EC.<sup>27</sup> This includes ensuring their access to rights and services on an equal footing with nationals if they fulfil certain criteria related to employment conditions, housing conditions, and/or educational and financial status. A Danish personal

<sup>23</sup> DIHR report 2017:37

<sup>24</sup> DIHR report 2017:10

<sup>25</sup> CERD report (CERD/22-24) 2019: 5.

<sup>26</sup> See statistics at: <https://integrationsbarometer.dk/aktuelt/6>

<sup>27</sup> See RCM report I for a longer discussion of this topic. The analysis in this section is based on the RCM report I and on data collected by the author of this report in anthropological fieldwork with homeless Romanian Roma in Copenhagen (Ravnbøl 2015; 2017 and 2018 (a)).

identification number, which is part of the civil registration system (the CPR number), is available to all citizens born in and/or residing in Denmark, as well as to EU citizens and third country nationals who have legal residence. Accessing a CPR number facilitates access to a number of public services such as social benefits, public health care and public education. In the case of other EU citizens, the CPR number is obtained with their registered status as EU workers, students in a recognised educational programme, self-employed business owners, or self-supporting (including economically non-active persons) with the funds to self-maintain.<sup>28</sup>

The Danish authorities request that an EU worker must have a registered residential address plus an employment contract with an estimated employment period of more than 10-12 weeks and more than 10-12 hours per week in order to issue a CPR number.<sup>29</sup> If the conditions of the Danish State Administration to obtain a CPR number are not met, a general taxation number can be issued instead, but does not grant access to public services such as social benefits, public health care, public education, etc.

The interpretation of EU Directive 2004/38/EC in the Danish context reflects Article 7 (1) (b), which limits the possibilities for residency by persons who lack the financial means to be self-supporting, who are not enrolled in a course of study, or who do not have the possibilities to access housing and formal employment. This particularly affects EU citizens arriving in Denmark who come from conditions of poverty and who are low-skilled with no official prior employment record. The regulated labour market, the expensive housing market, and the requirements for CPR registration (and thereby for social assistance) further strengthen the barriers many destitute EU citizens experience when establishing themselves in Denmark. Consequently, destitute citizens of other EU Member States have frequently resorted to living in the streets, including sleeping rough in parks and other green areas.

The Romanian Roma who have been interviewed in connection with this report live under such circumstances, as do a range of non-Roma citizens of other EU Member States as well as irregular migrants from countries outside the EU (third country nationals). The Roma women and men who were interviewed come from an entirely Roma neighbourhood in Romania where most live in conditions of poverty or even extreme poverty (unable to afford three daily meals). The adult family members are unemployed, and most have only completed a few years of school. In most families the children are enrolled in school in Romania while the parents travel abroad to earn money to cover their basic household expenses. These Roma women and men live in homelessness in Copenhagen and have no educational records or very limited ones. Very few speak English. The vast majority only have informal working experience in the shadow economy of Romania or another EU Member State. This hinders their access to the regulated Danish labour market, so they therefore resort to living and working in the street (e.g., with scrap collection).<sup>30</sup>

It is important to underline that the experiences of this group of homeless Roma are not representative of all the Roma from EU Member States who might live and work in Denmark. They primarily represent the concerns of destitute migrants who cannot fulfil the criteria to register as EU workers, students, self-employed, etc.

---

<sup>28</sup> See the Danish State Administration: <https://www.statsforvaltningen.dk/site.aspx?p=6116> and <https://international.kk.dk/artikel/how-do-i-get-cpr-number> The funds to self-maintain must at a minimum correspond to the sum of the benefits to which the person is entitled pursuant to Section 25, sub-section 12, and Section 34 of the Active Social Policy Act (available at: <https://www.retsinformation.dk/Forms/R0710.aspx?id=19124>).

<sup>29</sup> See the Danish State Administration: <https://www.statsforvaltningen.dk/site.aspx?p=6116>. These requirements are inspired by case law from the European Court of Justice that set the minimum employment conditions at 10 to 12 weeks of more than 10 to 12 working hours per week; see the judgement Kempf (C-139/85) and Megner and Scheffel (C-444/93).

<sup>30</sup> For more information please consult Ravnboel 2015; 2017 and 2018 (b).

### **Example of promising practice**

A church-based organisation, *Kirkens Korshær* runs an initiative called *Kompasset* to help EU-mobile populations in Copenhagen. Many of their service users have just limited knowledge of English and either no formal work experience record to present when seeking jobs or a negligible amount. *Kompasset* assists them with accessing information about the Danish system, how to register for and get employment, and what will enable them to access public services such as education or healthcare and integrate into Danish society. The initiative also helps persons in situations of homelessness by providing legal advice and personal support through the assistance of staff and volunteers who speak the main European languages. Service users can get advice and moral support in English, Romanian, French, Spanish, German, Polish, Italian and Bulgarian.

Services for EU-mobile populations such as those provided by *Kompasset* should be expanded and provided in cooperation with employment officials in Danish municipalities to further assist people in finding work, since this could potentially also be a way to reach out to those persons who are more limited in their job-searching (since they do not speak English and do not have a prior working record) so they can find jobs that do not require such skills.

One example of such enhanced state/civil society cooperation comes from Denmark's neighbouring country, Sweden, where a church-based organisation called *Stadsmissionen* has developed a labour market integration initiative in the city of Gothenburg. From May 2017 to May 2018 there was a team established at Crossroads (Gothenburg) called the Work Integration Unit that worked with disadvantaged EU citizens to support their integration into the Swedish labour market. In 2017, that 116 persons found employment out of about 300 people enrolled with the unit. In 2018, the figure increased when 143 out of 250 people found jobs with the unit's support. The methods used by the team were:

1. Matching and selection
2. Analysis of recruitment results
3. Supported employment (SIUS)
4. MI (motivational interviews)
5. Language training (in Swedish, including literacy).

*Information supplied by Stockholms Stadsmission, Crossroads, Gothenburg, Sweden in April 2019 and online: <https://kompasset.kirkenskorshaer.dk/>*

## HOUSING AND ESSENTIAL PUBLIC SERVICES

The Danish State is obliged to ensure equal access to housing by allocating social housing to disadvantaged persons and families. Consequently, municipalities in Denmark should allocate housing when needed and can dispose of 25% of all the vacant family dwellings and dwellings for young people available in social housing to solve social housing problems.<sup>31</sup> This means municipalities enter into agreements with private housing companies to use private dwellings as social housing for persons/families in need. These agreements must include a minimum of two and a maximum of four dwellings per private housing estate. The municipality pays the private housing company a reimbursement fee defined by the State for each dwelling used for social housing.<sup>32</sup> These regulations are defined in national legislation on social housing and are in line with international and regional conventions such as the European Social Charter's Article 16, which defines access to housing.<sup>33</sup>

One example of a recent governmental initiative in social housing that specifically affects ethnic minorities is the recent governmental strategy to address what are defined as "parallel societies" in Denmark.<sup>34</sup> In a recent report to CERD, state authorities describe the strategy's aim is to: "*address the problems with residential areas that have major challenges related to a disproportionate share of residents who are unemployed, have a low income or education, or who have criminal records.*"<sup>35</sup> The strategy distinguishes between what is defined to be "deprived neighbourhoods" and what is defined to be "ghetto areas". It is stated that ghetto areas all have issues with aforementioned criteria as well as a higher proportion of "non-Western" immigrants than "deprived neighbourhoods" do.

The strategy launches a range of measures to be enacted to address "ghetto areas" including: 1) Demolishing and renovating structures in vulnerable neighbourhoods. 2) Stronger enforcement as to who can or cannot live in vulnerable neighbourhoods. 3) Stronger police efforts and higher penalties to fight crime and create more security. 4) A good start in life for all children and young people.<sup>36</sup> These measures will be further explained in the next section.

The recent strategy against "parallel societies" has, however, been met with concern by several scholars, organisations and institutions, including the DIHR.<sup>37</sup> The main concerns are that the strategy establishes that a residential area can be defined as a "ghetto area" when more than 50% of its residents are of "non-Western" origin. In other words, not just socio-economic factors, but also ethnic factors influence the labelling of an area as a "ghetto".

---

<sup>31</sup> CERD report (CERD/22-24) 2019:19

<sup>32</sup> See more information at: <https://www.trafikstyrelsen.dk/DA/Bolig/Bolig/Private-lejeboliger/Anvisning-og-udlejning.aspx> and Law no. 1045 of 6 November 2009 available at: <https://www.lovtidende.dk/Forms/L0700.aspx?s31=10&s19=1045&s20=2009>

<sup>33</sup> Law no. 119 of 1 February 2019, available at: <https://www.retsinformation.dk/Forms/R0710.aspx?id=206725>

<sup>34</sup> The strategy is published by Regeringen (2018) and is available at: <https://www.regeringen.dk/nyheder/ghettoudspil/> (see publication list)

<sup>35</sup> CERD report CERD/22-24) 2019:6.

<sup>36</sup> Regeringen 2018

<sup>37</sup> See: <https://videnskab.dk/kultur-samfund/parallelsamfund-er-noget-politikerne-har-opfundet> ; See response by DIHR to Denmark's periodic report to CERD (2018): <https://menneskeret.dk/hoeringssvar/danmarks-22-24-periodiske-rapport-fns-racediskriminationskomite;>

Furthermore, the demolition of housing in these “ghetto areas” is a concern, since there is a lack of affordable, permanent housing options in many Danish municipalities. It is uncertain where and how evicted families can resettle if their housing is designated for demolition. The municipality bears the responsibility for relocating the families to new housing, but it is uncertain what the costs of new housing will be. Other concerns include the fact that the strategy allows for certain restrictions on the social benefits of families who live in the “ghetto areas” if they do not fulfil the regulations established by the new measures. One example is the fourth initiative in the strategy, which concerns a “good start in life for all children and young people”. One of the requirements under this initiative is compulsory preschool attendance of 25 hours per week by children who are one year old or older. Families in the residential areas defined as “ghetto areas” who do not comply with this new preschool regulation will have their child support benefits reduced.

Critics also argue that the strategy intensifies pressure on ethnic minorities who are already in a vulnerable situation and specifically affected by the context of the authorities having reduced the level of social welfare benefits available for certain categories of new arrivals in Denmark, as described by ECRl in the 2017 report. In that report, ECRl expressed concern that refugees and persons who have been granted subsidiary protection receive social welfare benefits at amounts that are widely seen as being too low to facilitate integration into Danish society. The report describes how the Integration Act was amended in August 2015 to re-introduce an “integration benefit” for newly-arrived persons who have not resided in Denmark for at least seven out of the last eight years.<sup>38</sup> This benefit is substantially lower than regular social welfare. A single person receives 5,945 DKK (800 EUR) per month and a married couple with children 16,638 DKK (2,230 EUR). The regular monthly social welfare allowances, by comparison, are 10,849 DKK (1,450 EUR) and 28,832 DKK (3,860 EUR), respectively. In its third report on Denmark, ECRl had already criticised the existence of a similar reduced benefit scheme at the time (the “start allowance”) and reiterated this critique in the fourth ECRl report in 2012.<sup>39</sup>

### The fight against discrimination, residential segregation and other forms of antigypsyism in housing

As mentioned continuously throughout this report, there is no data available on Roma and social housing and there are no particular efforts to address antigypsyism in housing.

The new governmental strategy against “parallel societies” can potentially affect Roma families who live in residential areas on the list of “ghetto areas” in the new strategy. It could affect them if they live on housing estates that will be designated for demolition, since many of the municipalities have no alternative housing options available for relocating such evictees. It could also affect Roma families with children of the preschool age (one year old or older) when the new measures for compulsory preschool are implemented.

There is a need to study further whether Roma families live in “ghetto areas” and whether and how they are being affected by the new strategy.

### Housing for EU citizens of Romani origin

As mentioned in the previous Roma Civil Monitor report on Denmark<sup>40</sup> and in the above section on employment, the interpretation of EU Directive 2004/38/EC in the Danish

<sup>38</sup> ECRl report 2017:22

<sup>39</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>40</sup> Ravnbøl, Camilla Ida (2018) (a) *Civil society monitoring report on implementation of the national Roma integration strategy in Denmark: Focusing on structural and horizontal preconditions for successful implementation of the strategy*. European Commission. April 2018. Available at: <https://cps.ceu.edu/roma-civil-monitor-reports>

context reflects Article 7 (1) (b), which limits the possibilities for residency by persons who lack the financial means to be self-supporting, who are not enrolled in a course of study, or who do not have the possibility to access housing and formal employment contracts. Persons who do not fulfil these criteria cannot access social services and assistance, including social housing. This particularly affects EU citizens who arrive in Denmark from conditions of poverty in their home countries. Many cannot afford the expense of housing, which is notoriously high in the larger cities in Denmark. Language barriers and the lack of long-term residence permits also make it difficult to access the private housing market.<sup>41</sup> EU citizens who cannot prove legal residence also experience difficulties in accessing many shelters in Denmark that require users prove their legal status, even though this practice conflicts with ministerial recommendations.<sup>42</sup> The group of Romanian Roma who have been interviewed in connection with this report, therefore, resort to rough sleeping since they have difficulties in finding shelter space. However, in 2017, amendments were made to the Danish Code on Public Order to enhance the legal means for the police to arrest homeless persons who camp in public spaces.<sup>43</sup> The amendments came in response to political debates about homeless Roma in Copenhagen<sup>44</sup> and criticised the limitations that exist for expelling EU citizens from Denmark.

Later in 2017, the Government expanded the existing entry zone prohibitions to include entire municipalities, meaning that people who are convicted of establishing “camp-like conditions” can be banned from entering a municipality for a period of up to two years.<sup>45</sup> The DIHR, which had also previously criticised the Government for criminalising homelessness, expressed concern over the expansion of the entry zone prohibitions to include municipalities. It was argued by the DIHR that the penalty is potentially disproportionate to the crime (of rough sleeping in “camp-like conditions”).<sup>46</sup>

Since the amendments in 2017, the new sections of the Code on Public Order have become the main provisions applied during the arrest of citizens from other EU Member States who sleep in public spaces and during applications for their expulsion. Recent numbers show that 389 persons have been arrested and charged under this new legislation, 300 of whom had Romanian citizenship. Only six had Danish nationality.<sup>47</sup> The author’s interviews and long term fieldwork with homeless Romanian Roma confirms such rising numbers, as many

---

<sup>41</sup> See: *Ibid.*

<sup>42</sup> The Ministry for Children, Equity and Social Relations (at the time) in 2014 affirmed that EU citizens have rights to access shelters and other social initiatives for the destitute in Denmark (see Ministerial statement at : <https://kompasset.kirkenskorshaer.dk/wp-content/uploads/2014/12/Orienteringsbrev-11-december.pdf> and DIHR report 2016 (b):19. There appears to be however, varying municipal interpretations of this right in practice and many shelters continue to turn down non-Danish users when they cannot prove legal residence status.

<sup>43</sup> See the new Section 3[4] and Section 6[4] of the Code on Public Order no. 511, 20 June 2005, announced on 31/03/2017: <https://www.retsinformation.dk/Forms/R0710.aspx?id=188528> (accessed 03.04.2019). The amendments also enhanced the penalty for begging in pedestrian areas, railway stations and means of public conveyance, requiring two weeks of unconditional imprisonment upon a first-time offence See the proposal for amendments to Section 197 of the Danish Criminal Code, No. 1052, 4 July 2016, proposed on 02/06/2017: [http://www.ft.dk/ripdf/samling/20161/lovforslag/l215/20161\\_l215\\_som\\_fremsat.pdf](http://www.ft.dk/ripdf/samling/20161/lovforslag/l215/20161_l215_som_fremsat.pdf) (accessed 03.04.2019).

<sup>44</sup> See: Ravnbøl 2018 (a).

<sup>45</sup> See the proposed law: <https://prodstoragehoeringspo.blob.core.windows.net/f7edcc82-ae75-4c0a-af5c-24fd74d5f65b/Udkast%20-%20lovforslag.pdf> and the response by the Danish Institute for Human Rights at: [https://menneskeret.dk/sites/menneskeret.dk/files/11\\_november\\_17/hoeringssvar\\_til\\_udkast\\_til\\_forslag\\_til\\_lov\\_om\\_aendring\\_af\\_lov\\_om\\_politiets\\_virksomhed.pdf](https://menneskeret.dk/sites/menneskeret.dk/files/11_november_17/hoeringssvar_til_udkast_til_forslag_til_lov_om_aendring_af_lov_om_politiets_virksomhed.pdf)

<sup>46</sup> See response by the Danish Institute for Human Rights at: [https://menneskeret.dk/sites/menneskeret.dk/files/11\\_november\\_17/hoeringssvar\\_til\\_udkast\\_til\\_forslag\\_til\\_lov\\_om\\_aendring\\_af\\_lov\\_om\\_politiets\\_virksomhed.pdf](https://menneskeret.dk/sites/menneskeret.dk/files/11_november_17/hoeringssvar_til_udkast_til_forslag_til_lov_om_aendring_af_lov_om_politiets_virksomhed.pdf)

<sup>47</sup> <https://www.dr.dk/nyheder/indland/byret-frifinder-hjemlos-far-og-son-sla-lejr-pa-stroget>

of those interviewed have experienced arrest since 2017 and been charged under this revised legal framework (see also previous Roma Civil Monitor report on Denmark).<sup>48</sup>

---

<sup>48</sup> Ravnbøl 2018 (a).

## IMPACT OF HEALTH CARE POLICIES ON ROMA

Health care in Denmark is financed by taxes and ensures universal coverage free of charge to citizens.<sup>49</sup> The public health system must be accessible in the sense that all citizens can utilize it on equal terms. This is established by Danish law and human rights provisions that Denmark has ratified.<sup>50</sup>

A study by the DIHR in 2014 showed that vulnerable ethnic minority patients pose a range of challenges to the Danish health care system. The study focused on analysing general practitioners' (GPs) encounters primarily with vulnerable patients of "non-Western" origin. The study identified factors and argued that in practice they lead to such patients being placed at a disadvantage with respect to their right to health care because of their ethnic origin. For example, the study highlighted concerns with the GPs' difficulties in assessing the symptoms of ethnic minority patients due to their lack of knowledge about the diseases frequently experienced by these patient groups, as well as communication barriers. The GPs also experience lack of referral options for ethnic minority patients with very complex health issues. The study also highlighted a criticisable quality of the language interpretation provided by the health care system, which cause misunderstandings and miscommunication.<sup>51</sup> More information about interpretation issues will be discussed below.

In order to address the complex health concerns of ethnic minority groups, health districts in Denmark have specific clinics that focus on ethnic minorities. Some municipalities also have health communicators who focus specifically on ethnic minorities and pre-natal classes designed specifically for ethnic minority women.<sup>52</sup>

Several studies highlight concerns with undocumented migrants as a patient group.<sup>53</sup> Undocumented migrants are only granted access to emergency health care in Denmark.<sup>54</sup> An Executive Order on the Right to Hospital Treatment notes that non-residents have rights to emergency treatment in cases of sudden illness, delivery, or aggravation of a chronic illness.<sup>55</sup> Denmark has not developed official policies or guidelines for health professionals concerning undocumented migrants' right to access health care. Studies of undocumented migrants' health in Denmark illustrate how formal legal barriers combine with other informal barriers within the health care system to prevent access. This includes language barriers in communicating with Danish health care staff and ethnic biases shared by health care practitioners.<sup>56</sup>

Both the DIHR study concerning ethnic minorities and the studies concerning documented migrants emphasize problems with language barriers. This topic is even more relevant today, since in 2017 new rules were enacted concerning interpretation in the health care system. According to Section 50 of the Health Act, all residents with a right to free treatment at hospitals by GPs or by specialists have the right to interpretation if the doctor

---

<sup>49</sup> Ravnbøl 2017:12.

<sup>50</sup> DIHR report 2014: 11.

<sup>51</sup> DIHR report 2014

<sup>52</sup> Communication with consultant of the Danish Health Authority; see also Danish Health Authority report 2017:5.

<sup>53</sup> D. Biwas, B. Toebes, A. Hjern, H. Asher and M. Norredam 2012; N. Jensen, M. Norredam, T. Draebel, M. Bogic, S. Priebe, and A. Krasnik 2011; Ravnbøl 2017.

<sup>54</sup> D. Biwas and B. Toebes et al. 2012; and N. Jensen, M. Norredam and T. Draebel 2011.

<sup>55</sup> D. Biwas, B. Toebes and A. Hjern et al. 2012; and Executive order on Right to Hospital Treatment, no. 293 of 27 March 2017 available at: <https://www.retsinformation.dk/forms/r0710.aspx?id=188398>

<sup>56</sup> D. Biwas, B. Toebes, A. Hjern, H. Asher and M. Norredam 2012; N. Jensen, M. Norredam, T. Draebel, M. Bogic, S. Priebe, and A. Krasnik 2011; Ravnbøl 2017.

finds it necessary for the treatment. In 2017, new rules about Section 50 were enacted as follows: *"With the primary aim of enhancing foreigners' incentive to learn Danish, new rules about interpretation fees came into force on 1 July 2018. According to Section 50, paragraph 2 of the Health Act, patients who have a need for interpretation and who have lived in Denmark for more than three years are charged a fee for the interpretation service provided by the Danish health authorities."*<sup>57</sup>

The new fee for interpretation has been criticised by several organisations and institutions that highlight the risk that when patients are requested to cover the fee of translation, then they will refrain from requesting translation. Conversations on medical treatment and diseases are of a complicated and complex nature where symptoms and diagnoses can be difficult to explain even for native speakers. Hence, there are risks of miscommunication and misunderstandings that can complicate treatment. Furthermore, another consequence of charging a user-fee for interpretation is that family members (adults as well as children 15 and older) may be used as interpreters for sick relatives. These places an unnecessary and concerning burden on the relatives in question.<sup>58</sup>

### The fight against discrimination and antigypsyism in health care

There are no health strategies or initiatives specifically for Roma, neither at governmental nor at municipal level.

Roma families may potentially be affected by the general concerns regarding ethnic minorities in Denmark, including by the ethnic biases held by health care professionals, as well as by language barriers. The new fee for interpretation can potentially affect Roma patients if they have resided in Denmark for more than three years and do not comprehend the Danish language to the extent that they can communicate with health professionals. There is, therefore, a need to investigate further the challenges that the national Roma population experiences in regard to health care.

### Health concerns of EU citizens of Roma origin

A study by the author of this report indicates there are various health concerns among Roma women and men who live in homelessness in Copenhagen.<sup>59</sup> The study shows how they are affected by co-occurring diseases that are multiplied and enhanced by their ongoing mobility between the contexts of making precarious livelihoods in both Romania and Denmark. This includes the fact that these Roma women and men experience health concerns related to their situation of poverty in Romania, including non-vaccination, poor nutrition, limited access to health care and follow-up treatment, lack of health information, and limited maternal health care. They come from a segregated Roma neighbourhood and have very limited contact with the health care system in Romania. Most families cannot afford medicine and medical supplies. When they travel to Denmark, they are exposed to health concerns related to their homeless livelihoods, including risks associated with rough sleeping and diseases more prone to occur in homeless contexts (for example MRSA, hepatitis, body lice and scabies). Along with other homeless persons this group of Roma experiences severe economic and social inequality and lives in dangerous, poor conditions. They are exposed to a range of safety and environmental hazards, including various forms of violence and harsh weather conditions. Hence, they have higher rates of behavioural risk factors such as alcohol consumption, drug use and smoking tobacco.

<sup>57</sup> Denmark's periodic report to CERD (CERD/22-24) 2019: 21-22. Certain patient groups are exempted from the fee such as patients who due to psychological or physical reduced functional capacity have lost their ability to speak and/or comprehend the Danish language; Children who are not accompanied by their parents; Parents with a need for interpretation in connection with the treatment of their child as well as several others.

<sup>58</sup> See: <https://menneskeret.dk/nyheder/debat-boern-unge-ogsaa-betale-tolk>

<sup>59</sup> Ravnbøl 2017

The Roma women express a range of health concerns relating to pregnancies and gynaecological problems that are worsened by their livelihood conditions in Copenhagen. Sleeping rough and not having easy access to showering is particularly critical not just for expectant mothers but also for women who are not pregnant and describe abdominal pains that have worsened during their stay in Denmark. This includes infections in the abdomen and bladder related to sleeping outdoors, living under harsh weather conditions and lacking access to sanitation facilities (showers and toilets). Both women and men explain that they experience stress-related symptoms and some struggle with depression. For some, their psychiatric conditions have worsened because of the hardship of living and working in the street as well as their long-term absence from their children at home in Romania.<sup>60</sup>

Since these Roma do not have access to a CPR number, their main access to health care is emergency treatment at hospitals or a Red Cross volunteer-based medical clinic for irregular migrants in Copenhagen that was established in 2011 and primarily serves persons who do not have access to Danish public health insurance (based on a social security number) or to private health insurance. The clinic offers treatment to adults and children for diseases that are usually treated by GPs in the primary health care sector.<sup>61</sup> However, the clinic is limited in size and scope due to its non-profit nature and is entirely dependent upon private funding and volunteer health professionals.<sup>62</sup> The staff attempts to follow up on patients but has no established outpatient clinic and cannot follow up on patients whom they have forwarded to hospitals for emergency treatment. The clinic can at times (but by no means always) transfer patients for examinations outside the clinic requiring the use of x-rays, ultrasound, or other complex diagnosis.<sup>63</sup>

The homeless Roma women and men who were consulted in this study do not have access to non-acute medical treatment, nor do they have access to follow-up with a GP, although such measures are extremely important for vulnerable patients, including destitute and homeless populations.<sup>64</sup> Consequently, most of these Roma women and men experience deteriorating health conditions, since they are being affected by inadequate access to health care in both Denmark and Romania.

---

<sup>60</sup> Ravnbøl 2017:76

<sup>61</sup> Ravnbøl 2017:82

<sup>62</sup> Annual report of the Red Cross Clinic for Undocumented Migrants: Røde Kors, rapport 24. Aug-31. Dec 2015 Sundhedsklinik for udokumenterede migranter. Available at: <https://www.rodekors.dk/media/1913995/roede-kors-sundhedsklinik-2015.pdf>

<sup>63</sup> Ravnbøl 2017:82

<sup>64</sup> For more information see Ravnbøl 2017

## EDUCATION

Public education in Denmark is free of charge and established in national legislation. The national legal framework prohibits discrimination, including in the education system, where segregation of students on the basis of race and ethnicity is prohibited.

A broad range of initiatives exist in education that cannot be covered exhaustively by this report. They range from early childhood development initiatives, to child and youth education, to adult education. For example, in 2016 the Government launched a new strategy to strengthen early childhood education that had a specific focus on children from disadvantaged families. It aims to strengthen the inclusion of these children into early learning initiatives and to support their families better during their early years.<sup>65</sup> Pedagogical consultants use practice-oriented methods to provide counselling and guidance to pedagogical personnel in kindergartens, day nurseries, and day care facilities located in municipalities and institutions that have a high proportion of disadvantaged children.<sup>66</sup>

With regard to the education of minority children, another example of such an initiative is the "Integration and Education" online portal. In November 2016 several ministries cooperated to launch the portal as a source of information primarily targeting employees of municipalities and asylum centres who are in contact with refugees and educational institutions.<sup>67</sup> The portal describes the existing initiatives for the education of new arrivals, including Danish language education, educational possibilities for children and youth, and adult education. (See also the description of vocational training possibilities as part of the IGU in the employment section above).

Mother tongue instruction for children is available in some municipalities, but is only a legal requirement for children who come from the EU, the European Economic Area (EEA), the Faeroe Islands and Greenland. This means language instruction in Romanian, Bulgarian, Hungarian or Polish, etc., is a requirement, since these countries are within the EU. It is voluntary for municipalities to offer such instruction in other languages (e.g., Arabic, Urdu, Turkish or Farsi). Copenhagen municipality, however, took the political decision to offer mother tongue courses in these languages for children and youth also, but it is not integrated into the curricula and takes place outside school hours. Until 2013 it was possible for those training to become primary school teachers to specialise in the subject of "Danish as a second language", which meant some teachers were specifically trained to assist bilingual children. That specialisation ceased to be offered in 2013. It has been pointed out by several scholars that not integrating mother tongue instruction and "Danish as a second language" classes into the curriculum, combined with the lack of teachers specifically trained to work with Danish as a second language, has resulted in practice in the use of a discourse of assimilation within the public education system that fails to take into account the specific linguistic developmental needs of ethnic minority children.<sup>68</sup>

There are ongoing debates about the differential treatment of ethnic minorities in the education system. Statistics show that children (especially boys) of "non-Western" origin in general have a lower grade score compared with children of Danish origin (1.4 to 1.8 points lower). Young males of "non-Western" origin also have a lower educational attainment rate (49%) compared with young women of "non-Western" origin (70%) as well as young men and women of Danish origin (73% and 81% respectively).<sup>69</sup> A recent

---

<sup>65</sup> See strategy at: <https://www.ft.dk/samling/20161/almdel/SOU/bilag/210/1748888/index.htm>

<sup>66</sup> <https://www.ft.dk/samling/20161/almdel/SOU/bilag/210/1748888/index.htm>

<sup>67</sup> See portal at: <https://ufm.dk/uddannelse/integration-pa-uddannelsesomradet>

<sup>68</sup> <https://www.folkeskolen.dk/646159/hvad-skete-der-med-dansk-som-andetsprog>

<sup>69</sup> Gilliam 2018:10.

study by Associate Professor Laura Gilliam argues that these statistics must be evaluated alongside other socio-economic conditions of the children's families in order to differentiate among the factors that create barriers for these children's educational progress. In this regard, economic status may prove to have a much larger impact than any so-called "ethnic factors".<sup>70</sup> In the study, Gilliam investigates the experiences of older boys (16-18) of "non-Western" origin. She finds that the differences seemingly correlated with ethnicity and gender result from a multiplicity of factors including language barriers, socio-economic inequality, gender norms, social marginalisation, and ethnic biases among teachers and staff.<sup>71</sup> Gilliam further shows that experiences of differential treatment in this group stem from a combination of factors that cause institutional discrimination (e.g., lack of mother tongue instruction at school) as well as individual experiences with ethnic biases among teachers that generate negative expectations.<sup>72</sup>

Studies from 2006 and 2016 point to concerns of discrimination in the enterprises receiving apprentices from vocational colleges. In 2006, 40% of apprenticeship consultants said enterprises either preferred or requested apprentices of specific ethnic backgrounds.<sup>73</sup> A study from 2016 showed progress in this field, but pinpointed that 25% of apprenticeship consultants still reported enterprises often prefer or require specific ethnic backgrounds when receiving graduates of vocational colleges.<sup>74</sup>

#### The fight against discrimination, segregation and other forms of antigypsyism in education

One recent incident concerning school segregation on the grounds of ethnicity happened in the city of Århus, where a school (Langkær Gymnasium) separated children according to their surnames - children with Danish surnames were separated from those with non-Danish surnames. The DIHR complained against the practice to the Board on Equal Treatment, and ECRI also criticised the practice in its 2017 report: "*ECRI recommends that the authorities take urgent measures to end ethnic segregation in the Langkaer school in Aarhus and prevent any such practices in Danish schools. ECRI reiterates its 2012 recommendation about the need to combat school segregation by devising, in consultation with all the parties concerned and taking into account the socio-economic dimension (employment and housing) policies to avoid, in the best interests of the child, pupils from minority groups being overrepresented in certain schools*".<sup>75</sup> The Langkær school subsequently decided to end the segregation practice.<sup>76</sup>

Another area that deserves further analysis is school segregation due to the distribution of school districts. Studies show that schools in vulnerable residential areas have lower PISA scores compared to schools in residential areas of higher socio-economic standards, and that more children of "non-Western" origin attend schools with lower PISA scores. There is an ongoing debate about whether and how the current practice of designing school districts perpetuates segregation of children by ethnicity as well as socio-economic status. For example, statistics show that in the residential areas with schools that have good reputations, housing values are higher and vice versa -property values are lower in areas with schools that have lower PISA scores. This means that

---

<sup>70</sup> Gilliam 2018:10-11.

<sup>71</sup> Gilliam 2018:12.

<sup>72</sup> Gilliam 2018:14-16

<sup>73</sup> Slot 2008

<sup>74</sup> DIHR report 2016:5.

<sup>75</sup> ECRI report 2017:10.

<sup>76</sup> See news about the case at: <https://www.dr.dk/nyheder/politik/langkaer-gymnasium-har-rettet-ind-og-slipper-sag>

families with better socio-economic conditions have easier access to good schools compared to more vulnerable families.<sup>77</sup>

In RCM report (I) the past experiences of Roma children with school segregation were highlighted.<sup>78</sup> In the period 1982-2004, the municipality of Elsinore, where a significant percentage of the national Roma population is estimated to live, established Roma-specific school classes as well as a Roma-specific social service office. The municipality argued that these exclusive programmes for Roma were designed with the intention to support the population, but in practice the initiatives showed they had the opposite effect of further enhancing social exclusion.<sup>79</sup> A Master's thesis by Heidi Jensen from 1995 investigated the experiences of Roma children in a school class in Elsinore in the 1990s. Jensen's thesis included interviews with Roma children and their parents who explained that they wished to keep their Roma identity hidden but still were placed in Roma-specific programmes highlighting their ethnic identity.<sup>80</sup> This Roma segregation received significant criticism for discriminating on the grounds of ethnic origin, including by the then-National Complaints Committee on Ethnic Equal Treatment,<sup>81</sup> as well as by the Danish Education Ministry<sup>82</sup> and the Council of Europe.<sup>83</sup> The Roma school classes were deemed unlawful and were finally abolished in 2004. According to communication with a member of the city council in Elsinore, all segregation practices have been stopped and there are currently no specific initiatives in place for the Roma population in Elsinore.

There are no particular initiatives against antigypsyism in the Danish educational system. There are no recent studies that document the experiences of Roma children and youth in Danish schools. Roma boys could potentially share some of the experiences with institutional discrimination and negative ethnic biases held by teachers that were described by the group of boys of "non-Western origin" who participated in Gilliam's study described above. Roma children could also be affected by practices of deselection when applying for apprenticeships in Danish enterprises, as described by the DIHR study mentioned above (i.e., not being members of a preferred ethnicity). These are two concrete topics that deserve more research in any future study of the experiences of Roma children and youth in the Danish education system.

### Education for EU citizens of Roma origin

As mentioned above and in the RCM report (I), access to public education in Denmark for EU citizens depends on registration as either an EU worker, student, or self-employed person, and in such cases a CPR number will be granted. Upon this CPR registration, there is a right to family reunification, and children can be enrolled in public education and receive mother tongue instruction if one of their parents is a citizen of another EU Member State.

Higher education in Denmark is free for students from the EU/EEA and Switzerland, as well as for students participating in an exchange programme. For other students, annual tuitions are charged that usually range from 6,000 to 16,000 EUR. The Danish State offers all Danish students a monthly scholarship called the State Educational Support (SU). Foreign students can apply for equal status with Danish citizens and thus be

<sup>77</sup> Gandil 2018.

<sup>78</sup> Ravnbøl 2018 (a).

<sup>79</sup> Jensen 1995; and: <http://romnet.dk/romaklasser.html>

<sup>80</sup> Jensen 1995.

<sup>81</sup> <https://ast.dk/naevn/ligebehandlingsnaevnet/afgoeelser-fra-ligebehandlingsnaevnet/#?FreeTextSearch=roma&AdmMyndighedNavn=Klagekomit%C3%A9en%20for%20Etensk%20Ligebehandling>

<sup>82</sup> <https://politiken.dk/indland/art4898007/Ministerium-Romaklasser-er-ulovlige>

<sup>83</sup> Council of Europe, ResCM, 2005:9.

approved to receive an SU. For example, equal status can be claimed under EU law if the student is an EU co-citizen, registers as an EU worker in Denmark, and then works for a minimum of 10-12 hours a week in addition to fulfilling the fulltime study programme. There are also other possibilities to apply for equal status and hence be granted the SU scholarship.<sup>84</sup> However, the State has defined that: *"In accordance with EU Directive (2004/38/EEC on the right of citizens of the Union and their family members to move and reside freely within the territory of the Member States), Denmark is only obliged to grant SU to respectively EU workers, self-employed persons and persons, who have retained this status, and their family members. Other EU/EEA citizens as well as Swiss citizens may only receive SU after 5 years of residence in Denmark"*<sup>85</sup>

International students are entitled to receive instruction in the Danish language as a foreign language. The language training programme consists of different levels and is divided into modules concluded by an official examination. As of 1 July 2018, a user fee per module has been implemented (approximately 2,000 DKK per module) for self-supporting immigrants (including EU citizens).

The Roma families who were followed in connection with this study, and who live and work in the streets of Copenhagen, do not have contact with the Danish education system. The vast majority are 18 or over and do not bring their children with them to Denmark. Rather, parents leave their young children in Romania under the care of relatives when they travel to earn a livelihood through scrap metal collection in Denmark. All of the respondents, however, emphasised their interest in being able to live with their families in Denmark and enrol their children in the educational system here so they would not need to live apart. In order for such family reunification to be viable, they would need to access adequate housing and employment. The Roma women and men also expressed interest in learning Danish but recognised that their lack of educational training could present barriers to learning a new language.

---

<sup>84</sup> See more information at: <http://www.su.dk/english/su-as-a-foreign-citizen/equal-status-according-to-eu-law/>

<sup>85</sup> See: <http://www.su.dk/english/su-as-a-foreign-citizen/equal-status-according-to-eu-law/>

## RECOMMENDATIONS

The main recommendation of this report is to carry out a comprehensive, qualitative study on the experiences of the national Roma population within the fields of employment, housing, health and education. This study should be carried out by an independent institution or entity, if possible, with the active involvement of Romani researchers. It should be investigated whether the study could be financed by Roma Integration Funds.

For EU citizens of Romani origin, it is recommended that good practices for reaching out to destitute EU citizens be investigated in terms of their applicability to Roma. One example of good practice is the civil society initiative in the city of Gothenburg in Sweden called "Crossroads" (part of Göteborgs Kyrkliga Stadsmission). Crossroads establishes contact between destitute migrants and national authorities in Sweden as well as with employers in relevant industries. The migrants in this way have easier access to documents, knowledge about national regulations, help with accessing health care, and potential employment.<sup>86</sup> It is recommended that employment initiatives be enhanced by Danish municipalities increasingly cooperating with civil society initiatives to connect with EU co-citizens who could benefit from support in accessing the labour market.

The following list of recommendations addresses the main concern of this report, namely, the lack of data on the national Roma population in Denmark. In this sense, it directs itself to researchers and the development of a future qualitative study.

### Employment

#### **To researchers on employment:**

Study the experiences of Roma women and men within the field of employment with a specific view toward evaluating whether and how they are represented amongst the target groups of specific employment measures (target figures, the IGU model, etc).

### Housing and essential public services

#### **To researchers on housing and essential public services:**

Study the experiences of Roma women and men within the fields of housing and public services with a specific view toward evaluating whether and how they are affected by the recent strategy against "parallel societies".

### Impact of health care policies on Roma

#### **To researchers on health care policies:**

Study the experiences of Roma women and men within the field of health care with a specific view toward whether and how they are affected by the recent change of regulations on user-fees for interpretation services.

### Education

#### **To researchers on education:**

Study the experiences of Roma children and youth within the field of education with a specific view toward whether and how they experience direct and/or indirect

---

<sup>86</sup> From May 2017 to May 2018 there was a team established at Crossroads (Gothenburg) called the Work Integration Unit. The Unit worked with EU citizens in a disadvantageous position with the aim to support their integration into the Swedish labour market. In 2017, they achieved that 116 persons found employment (from about 300 people enrolled with the team). In 2018, the figure increased when 143 out of 250 people found jobs through the team's support (based on consultations with Crossroads Gothenburg). See more information at: <https://www.stadsmissionen.org/crossroads-hjalper-till-med-ansokan-om-tillfalligt-uppehallstillstand/> and [http://www.socialplatform.org/wp-content/uploads/2014/02/20131022\\_PPT\\_CrossRoads\\_SwedishPractice.pdf](http://www.socialplatform.org/wp-content/uploads/2014/02/20131022_PPT_CrossRoads_SwedishPractice.pdf)

discrimination at school (primary and/or secondary) as well as when applying for apprenticeships at Danish enterprises.

## BIBLIOGRAPHY

Andersen, Hans Skifer, Roger Andersson, Terje Wessel et al. (2016) "The impact of housing policies and housing markets of ethnic spatial segregation: comparing the capital cities of four Nordic welfare states" in *International Journal of Housing Policy*, 16/1, pp. 1-30

Anker, Jørgen, Jacob A. Holch and Mia H. Kristensen for Ramboll Management Consulting (2011) *Promoting social inclusion of Roma: a study of national policies*

Committee on Legal Affairs and Human Rights (2002) *Legal situation of Roma in Europe* (doc. 9397)

Council of Europe, ResCM(2005)9 *On the implementation of the Framework Convention for the protection of national minorities in Denmark*, available at: [https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result\\_details.aspx?ObjectID=09000016805d914f](https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectID=09000016805d914f)

Danish Institute for Human Rights

- (2017) *Hvornår må man lave positive særbehandling: Personer med etnisk minoritetsbaggrund på arbejdsmarkedet*, available at: [https://menneskeret.dk/sites/menneskeret.dk/files/media/dokumenter/udgivelser/ligebehandling\\_2017/imr\\_pos-saerbeh\\_2017.pdf](https://menneskeret.dk/sites/menneskeret.dk/files/media/dokumenter/udgivelser/ligebehandling_2017/imr_pos-saerbeh_2017.pdf) (accessed 03.04.2019).
- (2016) (a) *Uregistrerede migranter (Status rapport 2015-2016)*", available at: <https://menneskeret.dk/udgivelser/uregistrerede-migranter-status-2015-16> (accessed 03.04.2019)
- (2016) (b) *Retten til Bolig (Status 2015-2016)*. Available at: [https://menneskeret.dk/sites/menneskeret.dk/files/media/dokumenter/udgivelser/status/2015-16/delrapporter\\_med\\_issn/status\\_2015-16\\_delrapport\\_om\\_rettet\\_til\\_bolig\\_-\\_issn.pdf](https://menneskeret.dk/sites/menneskeret.dk/files/media/dokumenter/udgivelser/status/2015-16/delrapporter_med_issn/status_2015-16_delrapport_om_rettet_til_bolig_-_issn.pdf) (accessed 03.04.2019)
- (2016) (c) *Lige adgang til praktikpladser*. Written by Line Vikkelsø Slot for The Danish Institut for Human Rights. Available at: [https://menneskeret.dk/sites/menneskeret.dk/files/media/dokumenter/udgivelser/ligebehandling\\_2016/lige\\_adgang\\_til\\_praktikpladser.pdf](https://menneskeret.dk/sites/menneskeret.dk/files/media/dokumenter/udgivelser/ligebehandling_2016/lige_adgang_til_praktikpladser.pdf) (accessed 03.04.2019)
- (2015) *Parallel report to the Un Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination*, available at: <https://www.humanrights.dk/publications/parallel-report-un-committee-elimination-racial-discrimination-cerd-2015> (accessed 03.04.2019)
- (2014) *Lige adgang til sundhed: en analyse af praktiserende lægers møde med patienter med etnisk minoritetsbaggrund*. Available at: <https://menneskeret.dk/udgivelser/lige-adgang-sundhed-analyse-praktiserende-laegers-moede-patienter-etnisk> (accessed 03.04.2019)
- (2012) *The situation of Roma*, FRANET National Focal Point, Social Thematic Study, Denmark

European Commission against Racism and Intolerance (ECRI, 2017) *Report on Denmark (fifth monitoring cycle)*, available at: <https://www.coe.int/t/dghl/monitoring/ecri/country-by-country/denmark/DNK-CbC-V-2017-020-ENG.pdf>

Gandil, Mikkel Høst (2018) *Intergenerational mobility and equality of opportunity in primary education*. PhD thesis, August 2018. Faculty of Social Science, University of

Copenhagen. Available at: [https://www.econ.ku.dk/forskning-og-publikationer/Publikationer/ph.d\\_serie\\_2007-/Ph.D.196.pdf](https://www.econ.ku.dk/forskning-og-publikationer/Publikationer/ph.d_serie_2007-/Ph.D.196.pdf) (accessed 03.04.2018)

Gilliam, Laura (2018) *Minoritets-danske drenge i skolen: modvilje og forskelsbehandling*. Aarhus Universitetsforlag.

Jensen, Heidi (1995) *Kulturelle kamæleoner i den kommunale orden: et studie af sigøjnere og danskere i en dansk provinsby*, Master Thesis no. 78, Department of Anthropology, the University of Copenhagen.

Ministry for Social Affairs and Integration

- (2011) *Presentation to the European Commission of Denmark's National Roma Inclusion Strategy*, available at: [https://ec.europa.eu/info/sites/info/files/roma\\_denmark\\_strategy\\_en.pdf](https://ec.europa.eu/info/sites/info/files/roma_denmark_strategy_en.pdf)
- (2011) *Public consultations brief concerning the draft Danish National Roma Inclusion Strategy*, available at: [http://ec.europa.eu/justice/discrimination/files/roma\\_denmark\\_strategy\\_annex\\_1\\_da.pdf](http://ec.europa.eu/justice/discrimination/files/roma_denmark_strategy_annex_1_da.pdf)

Ravnbøl, Camilla Ida

- (2015), "Hjem og arbejde for hjemløse og arbejdsløse EU medborgere; rumænske romaers erfaringer fra København og Malmø" in *Socialmedicinsk Tidsskrift*, 92/3 (2015)
- (2017), "Doubling syndemics: ethnographic accounts of the health situation for homeless Romanian Roma in Copenhagen" in *Health and Human Rights Journal*, 19/2 Harvard School of Public Health
- (2018) (a) *Civil society monitoring report on implementation of the national Roma integration strategy in Denmark: Focusing on structural and horizontal preconditions for successful implementation of the strategy*. European Commission. April 2018. Available at: <https://cps.ceu.edu/roma-civil-monitor-reports>
- (2018) (b) *Bottle Hunters: An ethnography of law and life among homeless Roma in Copenhagen*, PhD dissertation, 12<sup>th</sup> December 2018. Department of Anthropology, the University of Copenhagen.

Regeringen (2018) *Ét Danmark uden parallelsamfund: Ingen ghettoer i 2030*.

"Strategy of the Danish Government." Available at: <https://www.regeringen.dk/nyheder/ghettoudspil/> (accessed 03.04.2019)

Slot, Line Vikkelsø (2008) *Praktikpladser og formidlingspraksis: praktikkonsulenten i spændingsfeltet mellem virksomhedskrav og hensynet til ikke-diskrimination* (study prepared for the Rockwool Foundation on basis of data from 2006). Available at: <https://www.rockwoolfonden.dk/app/uploads/2015/12/Praktikpladser-og-formidlingspraksis.arbejdsrapport18.pdf> (accessed 03.04.2019)

Sundhedsstyrelsen (2017) *Evalueringen af "Styrket indsats i svangreomsorgen for udsatte gravide* [Danish Health Authority report]. Available at: <https://www.sst.dk/da/puljer-og-projekter/2012/~media/F9D93D566D954476A865B389E3C1203E.ashx> (accessed 03.04.2019)

Udlændinge- og Integrationsministeriet [the Ministry of Immigration and Integration] (2015), *Medbestemmelse, ligebehandling og selvbestemmelse i Danmark: det nationale integrationsbarometer*, revideret udgave, august 2015. Available at: <https://integrationsbarometer.dk/tal-og-analyser/filer-tal-og-analyser/arkiv/medborgerskab-ligebehandling-og-selvbestemmelse-i-danmark-2015> (accessed 03.04.2019)

**Danish legislation:**

Act Prohibiting Discrimination in Employment, No. 1001, 24 August 2017. Available at: <https://www.retsinformation.dk/Forms/R0710.aspx?id=179869>

Act Concerning the Municipal Referral of Social Housing, No. 1045, 6 November 2009. Available at: <https://www.lovtidende.dk/Forms/L0700.aspx?s31=10&s19=1045&s20=2009> (accessed 03.04.2019)

Code on Public Order, No. 511 of 20 June 2005, announced on 31/03/2017. Available at: <https://www.retsinformation.dk/Forms/R0710.aspx?id=188528> (accessed 03.04.2019)

Danish Criminal Code, No. 1052 of 4 July 2016, proposed on 02/06/2017. Available at: [http://www.ft.dk/ripdf/samling/20161/lovforslag/l215/20161\\_l215\\_som\\_fremsat.pdf](http://www.ft.dk/ripdf/samling/20161/lovforslag/l215/20161_l215_som_fremsat.pdf) (accessed 03.04.2019).

Executive Order on the Right to Hospital Treatment, No. 293 of 27 March 2017. Available at: <https://www.retsinformation.dk/forms/r0710.aspx?id=188398> (accessed 03.04.2019)

## GETTING IN TOUCH WITH THE EU

### **In person**

All over the European Union there are hundreds of Europe Direct information centres. You can find the address of the centre nearest you at: [https://europa.eu/european-union/contact\\_en](https://europa.eu/european-union/contact_en)

### **On the phone or by email**

Europe Direct is a service that answers your questions about the European Union. You can contact this service:

- by freephone: 00 800 6 7 8 9 10 11 (certain operators may charge for these calls),
- at the following standard number: +32 22999696, or
- by email via: [https://europa.eu/european-union/contact\\_en](https://europa.eu/european-union/contact_en)

## FINDING INFORMATION ABOUT THE EU

### **Online**

Information about the European Union in all the official languages of the EU is available on the Europa website at: [https://europa.eu/european-union/index\\_en](https://europa.eu/european-union/index_en)

### **EU publications**

You can download or order free and priced EU publications from: <https://publications.europa.eu/en/publications>

Multiple copies of free publications may be obtained by contacting Europe Direct or your local information centre (see [https://europa.eu/european-union/contact\\_en](https://europa.eu/european-union/contact_en)).

### **EU law and related documents**

For access to legal information from the EU, including all EU law since 1952 in all the official language versions, go to EUR-Lex at: <http://eur-lex.europa.eu>

### **Open data from the EU**

The EU Open Data Portal (<http://data.europa.eu/euodp/en>) provides access to datasets from the EU. Data can be downloaded and reused for free, for both commercial and non-commercial purposes.

